

JACKSON HOUSING COMMISSION

SPECIAL MEETING – September 30, 2014

Reed Manor (Building C) – Board Room

AGENDA

1. MEETING CALLED TO ORDER at Noon.
2. ROLL CALL
Michelle Orthaus, President
James Stark, Vice-President
Gerald Montgomery, Commissioner
Michelle Woods, Commissioner
Patricia Davis-Dye, Commissioner
3. RESOLUTIONS
Resolution No. 2014-26: Legal Services Contract
4. Resolutions No. 2014-27: LJ Trumble Builders LLC contract for Shahan-Blackstone Office and Community Building Restoration
5. ADJOURNMENT
6. NEXT REGULAR MEETING: **October 15, 2014 – Reed Manor (Building C) – Board Room**

Jackson Housing Commission
Jackson, MI

The following Resolution was introduced by _____, read in full and considered:

RESOLUTION NO. 2014-26

WHEREAS, the Jackson Housing Commission staff followed the Commission's procurement policy for procuring legal services in accordance with applicable HUD policies, procedures, rules and regulations;

WHEREAS, the Commission contract files include the Independent Cost Estimate (ICE), Request for Proposals (RFP), Proposals, Evaluations of proposals and Non-Disclosure statements;

WHEREAS, Resolution 2013-06 restricts the Commission from securing legal services without Board approval;

WHEREAS, Pentiuk, Couvreur, and Kobiljak, P. C. was the lowest qualified bidder;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT the Commission authorizes the Executive Director to enter into a contract with the qualified law firm, Pentiuk, Couvreur, and Kobiljak, P. C. Attorney and Counsellor at Law for one (1) year, with the option of two (2) additional one (1) year extensions. The cost will be established by the hourly need for services.

Commissioner _____ **MOVED** to adopt the foregoing Resolution as introduced and read.

Commissioner _____ **SECONDED** the motion and, upon voice vote the "AYES" and "NAYS" were as follows:

AYES:

NAYS:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

_____ declared the motion carried and the Resolution adopted.

I hereby certify that the above Resolution was adopted at a Regular Meeting of the Jackson Housing Commission on September 30, 2014.

Patricia Tyus
Executive Director

Rationale for Legal Services

Firm Recommended: Pentiuk, Couvreur & Kobiljak, and P.C.

Cost: \$120.00 per hour for either partner or associate attorney; \$75.00 per hour for paralegal; \$1,800 for unemployment hearings & \$3,200 for Employee Grievance Hearings.

Rationale:

Pentiuk, Couvreur & Kobiljak, P.C. is recommended to provide legal services to the Jackson Housing Commission (JHC).

Pentiuk, Couvreur & Kobiljak, P.C. has over thirty five years of combined experience. They have experience working with public housing commissions/authorities and are familiar with HUD regulations according to their proposal and references.

Pentiuk, Couvreur & Kobiljak, P.C. is the reasonably priced firm for hourly rates but not for hearings. Their pricing for hearings should not have a bearing on the final outcome of the selection of a firm because as of to-date, the JHC has not had to hold an unemployment hearing or employee grievance hearing.

Pentiuk, Couvreur & Kobiljak, P.C. was also the most responsive to the RFP and provided an excellent presentation of what the firm has to offer.

Pentiuk, Couvreur & Kobiljak, P.C. also scored the highest, (90), from the review committee.

Independent Cost Estimate (ICE) For Legal Services

Source of Information

2013 Historical data submitted by the following companies White, Hotchkiss, & Falahee, PLLC and Pentiuik, Couvreur & Kobiljak

Services

Legal Services

Level of Detail

- **Experience**
A minimum of 10 years of legal experience that ranges from employee hearings, landlord/tenant issue, real estate law to criminal law.
- **References**
References should be available. Attorneys should be in good standing with the Michigan Bar Association and not on HUD's debarred contractor list.
- **Public Housing Experience**
Firm should have public housing experience
- **Quality, Compassion and Competence**
All attorneys should hold degrees from accredited colleges and each hold valid licenses in the State of Michigan.

Independent Cost Estimate (ICE)

The firm should be reasonable in their pricing for hourly rates. Qualifications should include experience and specialized areas that will address procurement and development issues.

Max. Cost Options:

	Collective Experience	Partner per Hour	Associate per Hour	Paralegal per Hour	Clerical per Hour	Unemployment Hearings	Employee Grievance Hearings
	Minimum 10 years	Maximum 250.00/hr.	Maximum 200.00/hr.	Maximum 150.00/hr.	Maximum 50.00/hr.	negotiable	negotiable

Prepared: 09/26/2014

Rating Forms Totals

Firm	Score 1	Score 2	Score 3	Average
Nacht, Roumel, Salvatour, Blanchard, and Walker	70	65	65	66.66
Roberts & Freatman	85	75	65	75
White, Hotchkiss & Falahie	85	0	0	85
Pentuk, Couvreur, & Kobiljak	95	95	80	90

Firm	Rate for Attorney	Rate of Paralegal/law clerk	Meeting Attendance	Unemployment Hearing	Employee Grievance Hearing	Other Cost
Nacht, Roumel, Salvatour, Blanchard, and Walker	\$200.00	\$100.00				175.00 Assoc. Attorney
Roberts & Freatman	\$225.00	100/50.0	Included	\$500.00	\$400.00	150.00 Assoc. Attorney
White, Hotchkiss & Falahie						
Pentuk, Couvreur, & Kobiljak	\$120.00	\$75.00	No charge for first 2 hours; \$120.00 there after	\$1,800/hearing	\$3,200/per hearing	A board range for the cost of each matter

Jackson Housing Commission
Jackson, MI

The following Resolution was introduced by _____, read in full and considered:

RESOLUTION NO. 2014-27

WHEREAS, January 2013, a flood caused extensive damages to the Shahan-Blackstone Office and Community Building, and an insurance claim was filed.

WHEREAS, A competitive procurement process was completed by the Commission's contracted Architect;

WHEREAS, LJ Trumble Builders LLC., Inc., of Lansing, Michigan, has submitted the only responsible bid for renovations;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT the Commission authorizes the Executive Director to enter into a contract with LJ Trumble Builders LLC., Inc. for up to the amount of \$171, 000.00 for the renovations of the Shahan Office and Community Building. The Architect, M. C. Smith and Associates and Architectural Group, INC, has prepared all the documents and will oversee the project.

Commissioner _____ **MOVED** to adopt the foregoing Resolution as introduced and read.

Commissioner _____ **SECONDED** the motion and, upon voice vote the "AYES" and "NAYS" were as follows:

AYES:

NAYS:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

_____ declared the motion carried and the Resolution adopted.

I hereby certify that the above Resolution was adopted at a Regular Meeting of the Jackson Housing Commission on September 30, 2014.

Patricia Tyus
Executive Director